

**MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE COUNCIL
HELD AT COUNCIL CHAMBER - CITY HALL, BRADFORD
ON TUESDAY, 13 DECEMBER 2016**

Commenced 1600
Concluded 1935

PRESENT

The Lord Mayor (Councillor) and Councillors:

LABOUR

A Ahmed	Akhtar	Amran	Azam
Bacon	Berry	Dodds	Duffy
Dunbar	Engel	Farley	Ferriby
Green	Greenwood	Hinchcliffe	Abid Hussain
Arshad Hussain	I Hussain	S Hussain	T Hussain
Iqbal	Jabar	Jamil	Johnson
H Khan	I Khan	Lal	Lee
Mohammed	Mullaney	Nazir	Peart
Pullen	Ross-Shaw	Salam	Shafiq
M Slater	V Slater	Swallow	Tait
Thirkill	Thornton	Wainwright	Warburton
Watson			

CONSERVATIVE

Ali	Barker	Brown	Cooke
Davies	Ellis	Gibbons	Heseltine
Mallinson	Miller	Pennington	M Pollard
Poulsen	Riaz	Rickard	Shaw
BM Smith	D Smith	Townend	Whiteley

LIBERAL DEMOCRAT

R Ahmed	Fear	Griffiths	N Pollard
Reid	Stelling	Stubbs	J Sunderland
R Sunderland	Ward		

GREEN

Love
Warnes

INDEPENDENTS

Hawkesworth
Naylor

**QUEENSBURY
INDEPENDENT**

L Cromie
P Cromie

INDEPENDENT

Morris

INDEPENDENT

Khadim Hussain

INDEPENDENT

Sajawal

The Lord Mayor in the Chair



59. DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

The following disclosures in matters under consideration were received:

Petition – Council support for physical access for people with disabilities (Minute 64)

Councillor Dale Smith declared an interest as co-Chair of the Strategic Disability Partnership and Councillor Miller as being registered disabled.

Motion – Looking After Bradford's Health: The Public's Priorities (Minute 74)

Councillor Griffiths declared an interest as a GP but was not currently affected by the proposals; Councillor Tariq Hussain declared that he was a member of the Board of Governors for Bradford Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust; and Councillor Fear declared that he was employed by NHS England and left the meeting for that item and therefore did not participate in the debate or the decision.

West Yorkshire Pension Fund Disinvestment from the Fossil Fuel Industry (Minute 77)

Councillor Thornton declared an interest as Chair of the West Yorkshire Pension Fund (WYPF) Joint Advisory Group and on the Investment Advisory Panel; Councillor Miller as a Council representative on the WYPF on the JAG and Investment Advisory Panel; and Councillor Imran Hussain as a member of his staff was a member on those WYPF bodies.

Recommendations of the Independent Remuneration Panel (Minute 79)

Councillors Dunbar and Engel declared a prejudicial interest as holders of an Executive Assistant position and left the meeting for that part of the item and therefore did not participate in the debate or that part of the decision. A declaration was made by all those Members in receipt of an allowance.

Unless otherwise indicated the disclosures were made on the basis of transparency and those Members remained in the meeting during consideration and voting on the items.

ACTION: *City Solicitor*

60. MINUTES

Resolved -

That the minutes of the meeting held on 18 October 2016 be signed as a correct record.

61. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Carmody, Hawarun Hussain, Ikram, Shabbir and Shaheen.



62. WRITTEN ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM THE LORD MAYOR

REVO PUBLIC SECTOR GOLD AWARD FOR CITY CENTRE REGENERATION

The Lord Mayor formally thanked all the Council staff who had worked towards the regeneration of Bradford City Centre which had been recognised by Revo (formerly the British Council of Shopping Centres) in awarding the national Public Sector Gold Award. In particular the judging panel drew attention to the introduction of the City Centre Growth Zone, the Council's part in the development of The Broadway Shopping Centre and the very noticeable improvements to the cityscape and environment.

NATIONAL AWARDS TO BRADFORD COUNCILLORS

Two Bradford Councillors had received national recognition in the 7th annual LGiU (Local Government information Unit) and CCLA Local Councillor Achievement Awards at a ceremony in London's Guildhall. Councillor Joanne Dodds was named "Metropolitan Borough Councillor of the Year" and Councillor Fozia Shaheen was honoured as "Young Councillor of the Year". The awards celebrated outstanding levels of service and commitment given to local communities, the building of strong relationships with community groups and Council partners and the positive changes brought about as a result.

ANNUAL CAROL SERVICE FOR THE CITY

The Lord Mayor welcomed everyone to attend the annual Carol Service for the City on 19 December 2016 a wonderful, festive gathering held in the splendid surroundings of Bradford Cathedral.

SEASON'S GREETINGS

Warm greetings of the season were extended to all Members and Officers of the Council who were wished a peaceful and relaxing Christmas and a happy and healthy New Year.

63. INSPECTION OF REPORTS AND BACKGROUND PAPERS

There were no restricted documents.

64. PETITIONS (Standing Order 11)

Kershaw Street, New Lane and Raglan Terrace, Laisterdyke – Request for closure of side road by means of bollards

Resolved –

That the petition be referred to the Bradford East Area Committee.



Rowan Avenue, Thornbury – Request for parking permits and traffic issues

Resolved –

That the petition be referred to the Bradford East Area Committee.

Increased car parking charges in the Ian Clough Hall and The Grove car parks

Resolved –

That the petition be referred to the Executive.

Closure of Queensbury Swimming Pool

Resolved –

That the petition be referred to the Executive.

Council support for physical access for people with disabilities

Resolved –

That the petition be referred to the Executive.

ACTION: City Solicitor

65. PUBLIC QUESTION TIME

There were no questions from members of the public.

66. MEMBERSHIP OF COMMITTEES AND JOINT COMMITTEES

Resolved –

- (1) That Councillor Sajawal be appointed to the Bradford East Area Committee in place of Councillor H Khan and Councillor H Khan be an alternate.**
- (2) That Councillor Thornton be appointed to the Bradford South Area Committee in place of Councillor Carmody.**
- (3) That Councillor Morris be appointed to the Keighley Area Committee in place Councillor Khadim Hussain.**
- (4) That Councillor Warnes be appointed to the Shipley Area Committee in place of Councillor Ross-Shaw and Councillor Ross-Shaw be an alternate.**



- (5) That Councillor Lee be appointed as an alternate for the Regulatory and Appeals Committee in place of Councillor Shabbir.

ACTION: *City Solicitor*

67. REPORT BY THE LEADER OF COUNCIL

Council Document “N” details the verbal questions from Members to the Leader of Council and the answers given on the matters contained in the Leader of Council’s written report.

68. MEMBER QUESTION TIME

Council Document “O” details the questions from Members to the Leader of Council and Portfolio Holders and the answers given.

69. RECOMMENDATION FROM THE GOVERNANCE AND AUDIT COMMITTEE - ANNUAL TREASURY MANAGEMENT REPORT 2015/16

At the meeting of the Governance and Audit Committee on 1 December 2016 consideration was given to the report of the Director of Finance (**Governance and Audit Committee Document “Q”**) showing the Council’s Treasury Management activities for the year ending 31 March 2016 and the document was forwarded to Council for adoption.

Resolved –

That the Annual Treasury Management Report 2015/16 (Governance and Audit Committee Document “Q”) be adopted.

ACTION: *Director of Finance*

70. RECOMMENDATION FROM THE GOVERNANCE AND AUDIT COMMITTEE - TREASURY MANAGEMENT MID YEAR REVIEW

At the meeting of the Governance and Audit Committee on 1 December 2016 the Director of Finance presented (**Governance and Audit Committee Document “R”**) containing the Council’s Treasury Mid Year Review up to 30 September 2016.

Resolved –

That the changes to the Treasury policy set out in section 2.6.3 of Governance and Audit Committee Document “R” be adopted.



ACTION: *Director of Finance*

71. HIGH CALORIE DRINKS

A motion was moved by Councillor Griffiths.

An amendment, as set out in the resolution below, moved by Councillor Cooke was carried.

Resolved –

Council notes that according to Public Health England:

Sugary drinks represent less than 5% of calorie intake for 11-18 year olds who are the largest consumers of such drinks.

Bradford has Yorkshire & The Humber's lowest rate of obesity at age 5 and this is declining.

Rates of obesity in Year 6 for the District are above the Yorkshire average. Levels of underweight in Bradford are the highest in the region and among the highest in the UK.

Council requests that the Healthy Weight Board, as part of developing a comprehensive strategy in response to obesity, considers the impact of high calorie drinks on weight levels in Bradford's young people taking account of the evidence on obesity and the causes of obesity.

ACTION: *Director of Public Health*

72. ONE CITY, ONE DISTRICT

A motion moved by Councillor Brown was defeated.

An amendment, as set out in the resolution below, moved by Councillor Warnes was carried.

Resolved –

Council notes that:

- (1) Bradford Council's services are vital for our community, especially for our most vulnerable citizens; yet these services are now at risk as a result of years of unprecedented cuts in financial support for local councils imposed by the Coalition and Conservative governments;**



- (2) Since 2010, central government support for Council services in Bradford has been cut by Conservative ministers (backed by Conservative MPs) by approximately £180 million;**
- (3) The Conservative government plans further cuts in support for Bradford Council services totalling over £80 million by 2020, by which time the Revenue Support Grant for our District will be reduced to zero;**
- (4) Changes in government policy introduced by the Conservatives since 2010 have increased the annual cost of Council services in Bradford – notably Social Care - by tens of millions of pounds;**
- (5) Conservative government cuts in support for Bradford Council are (a) mirrored by the determination of Conservative ministers to cut welfare support for the poorest in our society and to limit health and social care spending in real terms despite the growing crisis in these sectors, and (b) have been accompanied by tax cuts that have primarily benefitted the better off and contributed to the growing inequality in British society;**
- (6) The Leader of Bradford Council estimates that, by 2020, our Council will have “half the spending power we had in 2010”, and has warned that “we are fast approaching a tipping point beyond which we will see valued services stop and those that remain scaled back” in circumstances where the future of the Council “will be financially unsustainable without radical changes and reductions in spending on local services”;**
- (7) A report published by the Centre for Local Economic Strategies in 2014 concluded that Bradford Council’s limited “ability to bring in extra income due to a low tax base...makes it hard for City of Bradford MDC to mitigate what are already particularly disproportionate impacts”; that our area “suffers from deep deprivation and major inequalities”; that the Council is “in a very tough position” and the “major cuts to core budgets will result in greater health, economic and social inequalities within the district”.**
- (8) A report published by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation in 2015 assessed the impact of the ongoing Conservative cuts to local government budgets and acknowledged that Councils are having to centralise services “into multi-purpose hubs” in order to “both preserve services and increase efficiency”;**
- (9) The 2010 Conservative Party general election manifesto stated that “nothing underlines the powerlessness that many communities feel more than the loss of essential services”, and the 2015 Conservative Party general election manifesto promised to “work with councillors to deliver high quality, value for money services”;**



- (10) The Conservative-led Shipley Area Committee made the decision to close Shipley's toilets despite opposition from the local ward councillors (who suggested an alternative strategy that would have allowed the toilets to remain open).

This Council therefore:

- (1) Commends our officers for their efforts to maintain and defend the public services they provide and thanks them for their hard work and dedication;
- (2) Resolves to do our best to maintain essential local public services in the face of unprecedented cuts in central government funding enacted by a Conservative Party elected into office in May 2015 with support from just 24.3% of all registered voters.

ACTION: Chief Executive/all Strategic Directors

73. DEMENTIA FRIENDLY BRADFORD

A motion, as set out in the resolution below, was moved by Councillor Shaw and was carried.

Resolved –

Council notes and welcomes the work undertaken alongside health partners to raise awareness of dementia in the community as part of Bradford's Five Year Dementia Strategy

Council asks:

- 1. That progress on the dementia strategy is reported on a programmed basis to Health & Social Care Scrutiny Committee**
- 2. That efforts are made to involve other partners including housing organisations, business leadership and the police in developing a Dementia Friendly Bradford**

That work on training staff and volunteers to be dementia friendly is supported and that this is extended to include councillors.

ACTION: Director of Public Health/City Solicitor (Scrutiny Lead)/Director of Human Resources (Workforce Development/Member Development Manager)

74. LOOKING AFTER BRADFORD'S HEALTH: THE PUBLIC'S PRIORITIES

A motion, as set out in the resolution below, was moved by Councillor Hinchcliffe



and was carried.

Resolved –

This Council notes that:

- **The Sustainability and Transformation Plan (STP) for West Yorkshire and Harrogate assumes £1 billion of cuts in health spending over the next four years.**
- **West Yorkshire leaders and health and wellbeing boards have not been properly involved or consulted on the West Yorkshire STP.**
- **NHS England has kept the 44 regional STPs confidential. The West Yorkshire STP was published for the first time on 10 November.**
- **The Bradford STP has had greater local input but is still only a list of initiatives which may lead to a significant cut in health spending in Bradford.**

This Council resolves that:

- **Health, care and wellbeing services should be planned and delivered close to local communities, unless planning and delivery on a regional or sub-regional geography is necessary to achieve sustainability or to deliver better clinical outcomes.**
- **Engagement and consultation with the public on the recently published West Yorkshire and Harrogate Sustainability and Transformation Plan (including Bradford District and Craven) should start as soon as possible to allow the public to review the proposals and have their say on future health and social care services in the District, and on services available outside the District.**
- **The Health and Wellbeing Board and governance bodies of the Council and partners should be consulted on any new proposals as they are developed in the District or at West Yorkshire level.**

This Council requests that:

- **The Leader writes to NHS England asking them to let the public have their say on West Yorkshire plans.**
- **The Leader writes to the Lead on the Bradford & Craven STP to ask that a programme of public consultation is developed to ensure an open dialogue with Bradford District residents.**

ACTION: Leader of Council/Director of Public Health



75. MITIGATING THE IMPACT OF WELFARE AND BENEFIT CUTS ON THE POOREST PEOPLE IN THE DISTRICT

A motion, as set out in the resolution below, was moved by Councillor Bacon and was carried.

An amendment moved by Councillor Jeanette Sunderland was defeated.

Resolved -

This Council notes that:

- **The Welfare Cap has already affected 220 families in the District. A further 1,000 families will be hit from w/c 16 January 2017.**
- **Each of these families has at least three children.**
- **This comes on top of the four-year freeze on working tax credits for working families. In the meantime inflation is expected to rise.**
- **From April 2017 the two-child limit on entitlement will be introduced which will impact on even more families in the District.**
- **We are concerned that the cumulative effect of these changes will impact on children to a greater extent than ever before.**

This Council requests that:

The Chief Executive brings a paper to the Executive about how we can mitigate the impact of these welfare changes on the poorest families and how we can support parents to access employment.

ACTION: Chief Executive

76. BRADFORD EDUCATION COVENANT

Previous reference: Council Minutes 55 and 89 (2015/16)

The report of the Strategic Director Children's Services (**Document "P"**) provided an update of activity so far on the Bradford Education Covenant together with details of the Education Covenant Conference planned for January 2017.

Resolved –

- (1) That the report be received as a summary of the actions taken to involve stakeholders in further developing the Education Covenant.**



(2) That a 'Covenant Champion' be appointed to drive forward this innovative and exciting project to become a flagship development for the District.

(3) That the Council invites all stakeholders in Education in Bradford to actively pledge their commitment to the Covenant at the Education Covenant Conference.

ACTION: Strategic Director, Children's Services

77. WEST YORKSHIRE PENSION FUND DISINVESTMENT FROM THE FOSSIL FUEL INDUSTRY

Previous reference: Council Minute 59 (2015/16)

At the meeting of the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee on 19 October 2016 the report of the Director, West Yorkshire Pension Fund (WYPF) submitted a report (**Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee Document "T"**) following the resolution of Council that the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee and the Governance and Audit Committee complete a joint review of the scale of the WYPF's investment in the fossil fuel sector and the implications for the Pension Fund, the District and its current and retired public sector workers of any programme of disinvestment. The Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee resolved:

That this Committee:

- (1) Notes that West Yorkshire Pension Fund investment decisions are made by the Investment Advisory Panel which includes representatives of all West Yorkshire Districts as well as other interested parties, and not Bradford alone.
- (2) Notes that the Investment Advisory Panel considers the annual report of the Local Authority Pension Fund Forum which includes engagement activities with fossil fuel companies.
- (3) Agrees with the policy of positive engagement set by the Investment Advisory Panel.
- (4) Welcomes the progress achieved towards ensuring that the fossil fuel companies revise their business plans to take account of the COP21 agreement.
- (5) Welcomes continuing investment in green energy technology and production as the industry develops.
- (6) That the above decisions be referred to the Governance and Audit Committee and Full Council for information.

An amendment moved by Councillor Warnes was defeated.

Resolved –

That the resolution of the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee be



noted.

NO ACTION

78. ELECTED MEMBER REVIEW

The report of the City Solicitor (**Document “Q”**) indicated the outcome of an independent review into whether any change should be made to the number of Elected Members serving this Council. The findings were that the public felt there was no case for any change and the conclusion had been endorsed by Sir Rodney Brooke who provided oversight of the review.

An amendment moved by Councillor Cooke was defeated.

Resolved –

That Sir Rodney Brooke’s recommendations be adopted.

ACTION: *City Solicitor/Director of Finance (IT Services), Director of Human Resources (Workforce Development/Member Development Manager)*

79. RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE INDEPENDENT REMUNERATION PANEL - SPECIAL RESPONSIBILITY ALLOWANCES FOR EXECUTIVE ASSISTANTS AND ANNUAL UPDATING OF ALLOWANCES

The report of the City Solicitor (Document “R”) presented the recommendations of the Independent Remuneration Panel (IRP) on the SRA (Special Responsibility Allowance) payable to Members who undertake the role of Executive Assistant. The IRP also considered the annual updating of allowances in accordance with the percentage increase provided for by the local government pay settlement for the year ending October 2015.

Amendments moved by Councillors Cooke and Councillor Stubbs were defeated.

Resolved –

That the recommendations of the Independent Remuneration Panel in relation to the Executive Assistants be adopted and the Members Allowances Scheme be amended to give effect to those recommendations.

Note: Council did not approve the recommendation of the Independent Remuneration Panel on the updating of allowances in line with the local government pay settlements in 2016 and 2017 and the updating of travel and subsistence allowances in accordance with the rates claimable by officers

ACTION: *City Solicitor*



Lord Mayor

Note: These minutes are subject to approval as a correct record at the next meeting of the Council.

THESE MINUTES HAVE BEEN PRODUCED, WHEREVER POSSIBLE, ON RECYCLED PAPER

